R E P O R T R E S U M E S

ED 015 841 24 RE 001 046

A THIRD PROGRESS REPORT OF THE CRAFT PROJECT--TEACHING READING TO DISADVANTAGED PRIMARY GRADE URBAN NEGRO CHILDREN.

BY- HARRIS, ALBERT J. AND OTHERS
CITY UNIV. OF NEW YORK, DIV. OF TEACHER EDUCATION

REPORT NUMBER BR-5-0570-IR PUB DATE NOV 67
REPORT NUMBER CUNY-ORE-RR-67-12
EDRS PRICE MF-$0.25 HC-$0.40 8P.

DESCRIPTORS- *READING INSTRUCTION, BASIC READING, LANGUAGE EXPERIENCE APPROACH, *READING SKILLS, *DISADVANTAGED YOUTH, *METHODS RESEARCH, READING IMPROVEMENT, PHONICS, AUDIOVISUAL AIDS, READING ACHIEVEMENT,

THE 3-YEAR CRAFT PROJECT, COMPARING READING APPROACHES IN FIRST-GRADE TEACHING, STUDIED THE SKILLS-CENTERED APPROACH AND THE LANGUAGE-EXPERIENCE APPROACH. ABOUT 1,372 DISADVANTAGED CHILDREN IN NEW YORK CITY PARTICIPATED. THE RESULTS OF THE FIRST-GRADE STUDY AND THE PRELIMINARY RESULTS OF THE SECOND-GRADE STUDY WERE REPORTED LAST YEAR. THE RESULTS OF THE CONTINUATION OF THE SECOND-GRADE STUDY AND THE FIRST-GRADE REPLICATION RESULTS ARE PRESENTED IN THIS THIRD PROGRESS REPORT. SECOND-GRADE RESULTS SHOWED THAT THE SKILLS-CENTERED APPROACH WAS SUPERIOR TO THE LANGUAGE-EXPERIENCE APPROACH ON THE READING TESTS AND IN SPELLING. THE AUDIOVISUAL VARIATION OF THE LANGUAGE-EXPERIENCE APPROACH WAS LOWEST ON WORD DISCRIMINATION AND READING SUBTESTS. GREATER DIFFERENCES AMONG CLASSES WITHIN EACH METHOD INDICATED THAT THE TEACHER WAS MORE IMPORTANT THAN THE INSTRUCTIONAL TECHNIQUE. AN INTERCORRELATION MATRIX COMPUTATION REVEALED SOME FACTORS WHICH CORRELATED NEGATIVELY WITH READING ACHIEVEMENT. THE FIRST-GRADE REPLICATION STUDY USED THE FOUR ORIGINAL METHODS AND A PILOT METHOD WHICH COMBINED THE PHONOVISUAL TECHNIQUES WITH THE AUDIOVISUAL VARIATION OF THE LANGUAGE-EXPERIENCE APPROACH. THE SKILLS-CENTERED APPROACH PRODUCED SUPERIOR RESULTS IN SPELLING, AND THE PILOT METHOD PRODUCED SUPERIOR RESULTS IN VOCABULARY AND WORD STUDY SKILLS. THE FINAL CONCLUSIONS OF THE WHOLE PROJECT WILL BE REPORTED IN SPRING 1968. (NS)

DIVISION OF TEACHER EDUCATION OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK
535 EAST 80TH STREET, NEW YORK, N. Y. 10021

DEC 18 1967

Office of Research and Evaluation

RESEARCH REPORT

RE

ED015841

NO. 67-12

A THIRD PROGRESS REPORT OF THE CRAFT PROJECT: Teaching Reading to Disadvantaged Primary Grade Urban Negro Children*

by

Albert J. Harris
Blanche Serwer
Lawrence Gold
Coleman Morrison

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
OFFICE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL OFFICE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

November 1967

RE 001 046

*This is an interim report of Project No. 5-0570-2-12-1 supported by the U. S. Office of Education, the City University of New York, and the Board of Education of the City of New York. Dr. Serwer served as Assistant Director of the project in 1965-66; Dr. Gold was Assistant Director in 1966-67; and Dr. Morrison is Assistant Director in 1967-68.

This is a third progress report on the CRAFT Project. A year ago the first grade results were summarized and preliminary second grade results were reported. At present the second grade analysis has been completed and the third grade data are being analyzed. A replication study has been carried through the second grade and the main first grade results are also included in this report. The replication second grade results have not yet been analyzed.

First and second year summaries have been published in The Reading Teacher, issues for May, 1966 and May, 1967. Information contained in those summaries will be only briefly mentioned to allow time for reporting new data.

The CRAFT Project is essentially a study of two contrasting approaches in teaching beginning reading, Skills-Centered vs. Language-Experience. Each of these approaches had two variations. The Skills-Centered Approach included a Basal Reader Method and a Phonovisual Method which supplemented basal readers with a special phonics program. The Language-Experience Approach included a regular Language-Experience Method and one with audio-visual supplementation. The population consisted originally of 1,372 children, almost all Negro, in 48 first grade classes in 12 schools located in slum-ghetto areas. Of these, 1,141 completed the first grade posttests and 656 completed the second grade posttests. For the third grade follow-up over 1,100 of the original 1,372 were located.

Results of the Second Grade Continuation

The Metropolitan Upper Primary reading and spelling tests were used as second grade final tests. The mean grade equivalents for the two approaches and four methods are shown in Table 1, adjusted to equalize for differences in readiness at the beginning of the first grade. The Skills-Centered Approach surpassed the Language-Experience Approach on the three reading tests and on Spelling, but the differences were of doubtful significance statistically. The analysis was repeated using the first grade final tests as covariates, and the results are shown in Table 2. This was done to equalize the methods for first grade learning. The Skills-Centered Approach was still ahead but by a somewhat reduced amount, and the differences were still of doubtful significance. However, differences of this magnitude are frequently reported as significant when the pupil rather than the class is considered to be the unit.

Of the four methods, the LE-AV Method, which came out lowest in the second grade on word discrimination and reading subtests, suffered during the year from interruptions of consultant services and therefore cannot be fairly evaluated from these results.

The differences among class means was far greater within each method than between methods indicating that the teacher was far more important than the method of instruction. The various efforts made to identify factors related to good and poor teacher results in this study have not been very fruitful.

An intercorrelation matrix of 74 variables was computed to locate variables other than teaching method that were significantly correlated with the second grade results. Most of the resulting correlations were not significantly greater than zero. Among these factors that did not correlate with outcomes were teacher age and experience, community income and education, and most measures of instructional time and teacher activity. Among the factors negatively correlated with achievement were teacher absences, negative motivation, and time spent in supportive language arts activities, particularly in telling or reading stories to children. All outcome measures, including attitudinal measures, tended to be positively intercorrelated.

First Grade Replication Study

The CRAFT Project was replicated using 30 first grade teachers who taught new classes of children repeating the methods they used the first year. In addition to the four original methods, a fifth "Pilot" method was used with four teachers. This method combined Phonovisual phonic instruction with language-experience and audio-visual procedures.

The replication results for the five teaching methods are summarized in Table 3, as adjusted to equalize for reading readiness. The four original methods have essentially similar results. The Phonovisual classes had a slight and non-significant lead in Word Meaning and Word Study Skills, and the two Skills-Centered Methods were slightly ahead of the two Language-Experience methods in Spelling.

The Pilot method had the highest means in all subtests except Vocabulary, and equalled the national norm on Word Study Skills. However, a

comparison with the results of the same four teachers the previous year, shown in Table 4, suggests that instruction by better than average teachers may have been partially responsible for the results. The Pilot Method also probably benefited somewhat from a Hawthorne Effect.

Final conclusions will not be drawn until the third grade continuation and second grade replication results have been analyzed. We hope to have a final report ready by the spring of 1968.

Table 1

Grade Equivalents for Method and Approach of MAT Subtest Scores Adjusted by First Grade Pretests

Approach and Method	M A T Subtest				No. of Classes
	Word Knowledge[a]	Word Discrimination[a]	Reading[a]	Spelling[b]	
Skills-Centered					
BR	2.7	2.5	2.3	2.7	10
Ph	2.5	2.6	2.4	2.4	10
Total	2.6	2.6	2.4	2.5	20
Language-Experience					
LE	2.3	2.3	2.3	2.1	9
LE-AV	2.4	2.1	2.2	2.3	9
Total	2.4	2.2	2.2	2.2	18

Note: [a]Grade equivalents are based on New York City Norms.

[b]Grade equivalents are based on national Norms.

Table 2

Grade Equivalents for Method and Approach of MAT Subtests Scores Adjusted by First Grade Posttests

Approach and Method	M A T Subtest				No. of Classes
	Word Knowledge[a]	Word Discrimination[a]	Reading[a]	Spelling[b]	
Skills-Centered					
BR	2.6	2.4	2.3	2.6	10
Ph	2.5	2.6	2.4	2.4	10
Total	2.5	2.5	2.3	2.5	20
Language-Experience					
LE	2.4	2.4	2.3	2.2	9
LE-AV	2.4	2.2	2.2	2.3	9
Total	2.4	2.3	2.3	2.3	18

Note: [a]Grade equivalents are based on New York City Norms.

[b]Grade equivalents for Spelling are based on national Norms since no New York City Norms are available.

Table 3

Adjusted Grade Equivalents for the Five Methods
Replication First Grade

	BR	Ph	LE	LE-AV	Pilot
Stanford					
Word Reading	1.4	1.5	1.4	1.4	1.7
Paragraph Meaning	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.6
Vocabulary	1.4	1.5	1.4	1.5	1.4
Spelling	1.6	1.6	1.4	1.5	1.8
Word Study Skills	1.3	1.5	1.3	1.4	1.8

Table 4

Comparison of Grade Equivalents on the Stanford Posttests for Original and Replication Study Classes of the Four Pilot Teachers

Subtest	C R A F T	
	Original Classes 1964 - 1965	Replication Classes Pilot 1965 - 1966
Word Reading	1.6	1.7
Paragraph Meaning	1.6	1.6
Vocabulary	1.5	1.4
Spelling	1.9	1.8
Word Study Skills	1.6	1.8

Grade Equivalents are based on unweighted means of scores adjusted by First-Grade Pretests.